Yoga in Kāshmir Śaivism And Patañjali's System

(A Study in Interaction)

Synopsis Presents For
DOCTOR OF PHILOSPHY
IN
HUMAN CONSCIOUSNESS AND YOGIC SCIENCE

- Prof. Navjivan Rastogi
  Supervisor
- Dr. Suresh Barnwal
  Co-supervisor

Yatendra Dutt Amoli
Researcher

DEV SANSKRITI VISHWAVIDYALAYA
HARIDWAR (UTTRAKHAND)
2007

Yoga in Kāshmir Śaivism and Patañjali's system
(A study in interaction)

Introduction:-

Great thinker of Hindu traditions of Sàdhanà. Gòpinàth Kaviraj once remarked, "It is a truism that every system of theocratic culture in India has behind it a consistently evolved system of philosophical thought. It is difficult, in present state of our knowledge, to give a definite idea of the numbers of such systems in ancient and mediaeval times and even of the extent of literature comprised under each continued progress in researches in this field is likely to yield fresh materials favorable to the better understanding of the true history and philosophic value of these systems.[1]

Yog is a characteristic dimension of the Indian mind.[2] This observation is particularly relevant in the context of Tantric schools in general and Tantric Śaiva schools of Kashmir in particular in the Àgama literature basic to the tantric traditions, the fourfold division of Àgamic subject matter into doctrine (Jnana),Yoga ,ritual (kriya) and conduct(caryã) points to the essentiality of yoga in the tantric scheme. Some Ãgamas do follow this line of classification, but the majority, though subscribing to this division in principle, often fail to stick, to it in practice. Some times there is overlapping among the four, or an attempt – with or without conscious effort – is made, especially in the monistic śaiva tantras, to find out an equation or a mutual parallel. This tendency is at its peak; in the Tantraloka (TA) as well as it source Tantra, The Mãlinivijayottara (MVT).[3]

The observation by Mircea Eliade that yoga represents a "pan Indian corpus of spiritual techniques" [4] acquire more relevance. It appears that several techniques of yoga have earned acceptance in tantric saiva monism and that, despite their outward formation formal divergences, there is a close internal agreement. One of the important factors contributing to this agreement is a sort of genetic relationship with fundamental spirit of original yoga of Patañjali.

---

1. *The philosophy of tripura Tantra by Gopinath Kaviraj, article published in Saraswati Bhavan Studies Series.*
2. *Mircea Eliade, Yoga: Immortality and freedom, Trans. Williard R. Trask (Princeton, N.J., Princeton University Press, 1970), p.359.*
3. *Dr. N. Rastogi – The Yogic Disciplines in the Monistic Śaiva Tantric Traditions of Kashmir: Threefold, Fourfold and Six Limbed, in the Ritual and Speculation in Early Trantricism, Studies in the Honour of Andre's Padox, 1992, SUNNY Press, Albany, p.247.*
4. *Yoga: Immortality and Freedom, p359.*

We are investigation here, relationship of Patanjali's system of yoga to Kashmir Śaiva tradition of sādhana. The moment we think of Kashmir's philosophical and cultural heritage, we are immediately reminded of Kashmir Saivism (KS), the greatest humanistic attainment of Kashmir. This Kashmir Saivism is generally believed to be monistic in temper and idealistic in ideology. We have however, to be very clear that the word Kashmir Saivism has extremely wide connotation and includes within its range all the branches of Saiva speculation monistic, monistic cum dualistic and dualistic associated with Kashmir. This Saivism is elastic enough as to include Śākta schools of thought within its ambit. If Abhinavgupta's Tantraloka is any guide, the Trika or Kashmir Saivism stands for the total tantric lore of Kashmir. It has to specially stated that in his magnum opus i.e. Tantrakoka (the light of Tantras), Abinavgupta dwells on both diverse currents of thought namely Tantraprakriya and Kupaprakriya. While Tantraprakriya is traced straight to Tryambaka, the first ancestor referred to by somananda, the Kula Prakriya is traced to Trayamka through his daughter and is therefore designated as "Ardh –Trayambaks". To be brief, the Kula system is identified with Kula Prakriya, while the three independent monistic systems namely Trika, Krama and Pratyabhijna are subsumed under the Tantraprakriya of Trayambaka school.[5]

However it is matter of detailed discussion on the historical frame work of Kashmir Saivism, which will be a part of further work. Here we just want to introduce KS in brief introductory mode with its range of philosophical thoughts. The term Kashmir Saivism has extensive application and to some extent, it's import is geographical. There are two under currents of Indian thought – vedic and Trantric which may be designated respectively as vedic and tantric cultures as well Kashmir saivism is the essence of Tantric culture. According to Gopinath Kaviraj ji it respresents an extremely invaluable ancient treasure of Indian thought.[6]

In a special note Kaviraj Ji remarked, "As a matter of fact, the earliest school of yogic discipline is traditionally identified with the way of Bhairava (Stotas), which is based on a hidden knowledge of vaak, combining in it self the element of knowledge and action both. It is technically known as the path of spanda which is logically prior to Jnana and Kriya.[7]

---

5. *Dr. N. Rastogi, contribution of Kashmir to Philosophy and culture, Published in Annals of Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Poona, Vol.LVI, p-28(1975)*
6. *Bharatiya Saviskriti Aur Sādhanā, G.N. Kaviraj, Vol. I, p1,3.*
7. *G.N.Kaviraj, Introduction of a book, Mantras Aur Matrikaon Ka Rahasya by Shiv Shankar Avasthi, p-7. (1986)*

According to P.V. Kane, there are two main currents of Yoga. One propagated by Patanjala Yoga, is related to discipling the mind, the other, developed in Goraksasataka, Hatha Yoga Pradipika, and so on, to discipling the body.[8] There are known as Rajyoga and Hathayoga respectively. Patanjali's yoga does not deal with plexuses, arteries, and veins, whereas in Hathayoga the modes of sitting, breath control, physical posture and other practices seek to push forward the coiled energy (Kundalini) to the cranial aperture via the plexuses and central canal (susumna nadi). The description of yoga generally found in tantras reprints the combination of the two in many respects. But because the Hathayogic process can be enacted entirely mentally in the monistic saiva tantras, it emerges there as a mere variant of Rajayoga. In over view, there is a third current, too, which may be termed the supramental current concerned with revealing the identity of individual as pure ideality. The yoga of KS is linked with the growth of this third branch.[9]

In brief yoga in Kashmir Saivism which is often says Trika Yoga, therefore, lies not in attaining one's inactive witnessing state, but in realizing one's essence defined by intrinsic freedom of action and cognition. In other word, even though Pathanjali's yoga begins with activity, it rejects that by the time it reaches its finale. On other hand, Trika Yoga and for that matter Tantric Yoga as such, starts with activity and culminates in activity.

---

8. *See P.V. Kane, History of Dharmasastra (Kane), Vol.5, Pt II, 1962, p-1427.*

9. *Dr. N. Rastogi, Kashmir Sivadyavad Ki Mol Avdharnayain. Ch. 13, p-202, (MRML) 2002.*

Review of Literature:-

1. Vyasa, the celebrated commentator of the Yogasutra (YS), explicitly identifies yoga with Samadhi.[1] It is remarkable that Saiva authar Rajanak Ramakantha also employs yoga in this sense.[2]

2. Malinivijayottar Tantra deals with the yoga as realization of identity.[3]

3. According to Ksemaraja (KR), the term dhyana (visualization) in the MVT'S definition of asana includes breath control (pranayama), abstraction (pratyahara), retentive concentration (dharana), meditation and samadhi all together.[4]

4. Astanga yog itself is recognized as para yoga in Netra Tantra (NT), [5] but it is quite different from its namesake propagated by Patanjali. Even though all the terms are devived from Patanjali's, they carry gnostical defition.

5. Spanda Sandoh 3, 16 and KR[6] comes quite close to Patanjali in their presentation of asana. But KR's interpretation of S S 3. 6 reverses the trend and echoes the position taken by the Netra Tantra (NT) that replaces its substrate Jnanasakti with Saktabala (autonomous force).[7]

6. According to KR, the phrase bhutakaivalya in SS. 3,5 (freedom from element) denotes the stage of abstraction.[8] Isolation from the five elements leads to the abstraction of mind.

---

1. *Yogah Samadhih, Bhasya on Yoga Sutra 1/1*
2. *Samadhir yoga ucyate, S B. p-46, yogah samadhih S B, p-62, Sarvatobhadra commentary on the Bhagvad Gita (SB) by Rajanak Ramakantha (RK) (KSTS, 1943)*
3. *Malinivjayottar Tantra (MVT), KSTS, 1922, Vol. 4, p-4*
4. *Sivasutravimarsini (SSV) KSTS, Vol. 1, p-39*
5. *Netra Tantra (NT), (KR), (KSTS), 8, p- 9-16*
6. *Uddyota on Svacchanda Tantra (SVTU) by KR, (KSTS), 1922, p-290*
7. *Asyate nityam aikatmyena sthiyate asminn ity asanam param saktam balam, Sivasutravimarsini (SSV), KR, 1, p-46, (KSTS)*
8. *SSV on SS 3,5, pp. 39-40. SVT 7, 297-298 with uddyot*

7. The MVT, too, dwells briefly on pratyahara. By steadily concentrating on any external object such as sound. The mind becomes one with object during the course of grasping it. The MVT here squares with Patanjali's teaching on pratyahara except that the senses are replaced here by mind. [9]

8. Sri Vijnana Bhairava Tantra consist 112 types of Dharanas.[10] In some manner they are quite influenced by Patanjali's definition of dharana.

9. In the commentary of Iswarpratyabhijnavimarsani of Abhinavagupta, Bhaskarkantha (18 cent.) employs Astanga yoga for a yogi.[11]

10. In Netra Tanta (NT) we find description of Astanga Yoga [12]

11. K.R. the disciple of Vasugupta, views the suppression cessation of all "other" mental states as the most conductive element of yoga. [13]

12. The characteristic of yogin, according to Abhinavagupta (AG) is the inner blissful experience arising from the loss of states. [14]

---

9 *Yat kimcic citayad vastu nanyatavm pratipadyate I*
lena tanmayatam apya bhavet pascad abhavavat II
pancatam iva sampraptas tivrair api calyate I
tatah sabdadibhir yogi yoginikulandanah II
ityanena vidhanena pratyahrtya mano muhuh I
pranayamadikam sarvam kuryad yogaprasiddhaye II (MVT 17, 22-24)

10. *.Dharana word in (VBT) introduced by Bhatta Ananda birst in his commentary on VBT (Vijnana Kaumudi), Vijnana Bhairava, Vrijvallabh Diwedi, (MLBD), p-xx, (2004)*

11. *.Bhaskari, ed Ayyer and Pandey, Allahabad, 1938, Part – I, p-227*

12. *Netra Tanta 8/9, 8/21*

13. *.Tantraloka 3, 260 – 261*

14. *Anavisanto pi nimagnacitta jananti vrittiksayasaukhyam antah, (MVV) by AG, KSTS, 1921, 2, 114.*

Justification of Study:-

It is a need to distinguish Patanjal Yoga and Yoga of Kashmir Saivism separately, because mostly it is examined the same as six limbed Yoga of KS to eight limbed Yoga of Patnajali. Several techniques of Yoga have earned acceptance in Tantric Saiva monism and that, despite their outward formal divergences, there is a close internal agreement. One of the important factors contributing to this agreement is a sort of genetic relationship with the fundamental spirit of the original Yoga of Patanjali. By this work we are also re-accessing the mystical tradition of Tantra inspired form the statement of great visionary Gopinath Kaviraj (see beginning lines of Introduction)

Although here we explaining a text based study, but this research study is not only for the gathering of some intellectuals but also for the students of philosophy, yoga and ancient Indian sciences to see the Indian thoughts on a new horizon of interaction where K S meets Patanjal Yoga. The study specially explores a new discussion for the student of Yoga on Tantric scheme of thoughts where they know the Yogangas (Limbs of Yoga) as in Tantric cult. Clearly, they will know the basis of yogic thoughts and their Agamic sources.

From ancient to modern, there seems, no lose of scientific temper of our traditional knowledge. Tantra and Yoga are the scientific approaches of our spiritual heritage. By this study we want to prove the vitality of Tantra and Yoga in human life. It is a sense of awareness which connect us to supreme. At last it is my interest to search the deep core of our spiritual & mystical heritage.

Objective:-

This work aims at enquiring into the standard form of yoga in the monistic saiva tradition of Kashmir. The genesis of this enquiry lies in every statement one finds in the Patanjali's system of Yoga. Over the span of four hundred years, from ninth to thirteenth centuries, no one can miss an overt tendency to posit the Tantric yoga as six limbed (sadanga), distinguished from the eight limbed (astanga), yoga of Patanjali. In practice, however, this stand is countered by several parallel techniques laying a similar claim, necessitating a deeper perspective look into the whole problem.

According to Prof. Navjivan Rastogi, Patanjala yoga has substantially influenced the evolution of yoga in KS with regard to both inner structure and formal growth. This has led to two obvious consequences. One is the continued fidelity to astanga yoga despite the occasional leanings toward sadanga yoga; the other is that astanga yoga has gained acceptanced only after under going a transformation of its original stance. The second conclusion is that the intrinsic characteristics of the Tantric current have lent a new framework, shape, and thrust due to which yoga in KS represent a mixed from of Patanjala yoga and Hatha yoga, acquiring along the way a transcendental disposition. This is because of its sole occupation with immersion in or the rise of plenary awareness, which is nothing but the synthesis of knowledge and action.[1]

Kashmir Saiva philosophy introduce by the name Pratyabhijna School in the Sarvadarsan Sangarah of Sayan-Madhava.[2] Although we shall use the term Kashmir Saivism, which is already discussed.

The main objectives we are looking for interaction between yoga in KS and Yoga Sutras, as follows.

1. To observe the Kashmir Saivistic Yoga in its primary sources, Is there be a developed structure of Yoga?
2. To study the facts of convergences between the two systems i.e. Pantanjal Yoga & Kashmir Saivism.
3. To study the facts of divergences between above two.
4. To look on philosophical orientation of these two systems.

---

1. *Prof. Nivjivan Rastogi, Kashmir Sivadvyavad Ki Mool Avdharnayen (MRML), p.210, (2002)*
2. *Sarvadarsan Sangrah of Sayan-Madhav by Prof. Umasankar Rishi, Chaukhamba, Varanasi, 8, p-298*

Yoga in Kāshmir Śaivism and Patañjali's System
(A Study in Interaction)
Chapters

Chapter -I

Introduction

- Genesis of the research problem
- Scope and methodology of the research work
- Material on Yoga in Kashmir Saivism

Chapter – II

Origin, Growth and Essential Features of Patanjal Yoga and Kashmir Saivism

- Origin and Growth of Patanjal Yoga
- Origin and Growth of Kashmir Saivism
- Essential Features of Patanjal Yoga
- Essential Features of Kashmir Saivism.

Chapter – III

Philosophical Orientation of Patanjal Yoga and Kashmir Saivism

- Contextualization of Patanjal Yoga in Indian Philosophy
- Contextualization of Kashmir Saivism in Indian Philosophy
- Critical evaluation of modern presentation/exposition of Yoga of Kashmir Saivism in comparison to Patanjal Yoga.
- Eminent Yogins of Kashmir Saivism and their contribution.

Chapter – IV

Kashmir Saivistic Yoga in its primary sources

- The Agamic sources of Kashmir Saivism (a) Agamic (b) Semi-Agamic

- Yoga in the classical Kashmir Saivism
- Different kinds of Yoga in the sub-streams of Kashmir Saivism
- Distinction of Kashmir Saivism from other Tantric currents with special reference to Yoga.

Chapter – V

Convergences between Patanjal Yoga and Kashmir Saivism

- Formative influences of Patanjal Yoga on Kashmir Saivism.
- Advanced Saivistic exposition of some Yoga Sutras in Kashmir Saivism

Chapter – VI

Major divergences between Patanjal Yoga and Kashmir Saivism

Conclusion

Bibliography

Word Index

Bibliography

(In Alphabetical Order)

1. BhagavadGita, Rajanaka Ramakantha, Kashmir series of Texts and Studies(KSTS), 1943.
2. Bhaskari, Bhaskar Kantha, ed. K.A.S. Iyer and K.C. Pandey, Allahabad, 1938.
3. Chatterji, J.C., Kashmir Saivism, KSTS, 1914.
4. Dasgupta, S.N. Indian Idealism, Cambridge, 1962.
5. Dasgupta, S.N. The Yoga Philosophy, MLBD.
6. Dasgupta, S.N. Introduction to the History of Indian Philosophy, 5 vols, MLBD.
7. Dasgupta, S.N. The Philosophy of Pantanjal Yoga, MLBD.
8. Eliade, Mircea, Yoga: Immortality and Freedom, trans. Willard R. Trask, Princeton, N.J. Princeton University Press, 1970.
9. Guhyasamajatantra, ed. Benoytosh Bhattacharya Baroda Oriental Institute, 1967.
10. Hiriyanna, M., Outlines of Indian Philosophy, MLBD, 2000.
11. Kasika on Astadhyayi, Vamana and Jayaditya, Kashi Sanskrit Granthamala, 1952.
12. Kane, P.V., History of Dharmasastra, Poona, 1962.
13. Maharthamanjari, Mahesvarananda, ed. B.V. Dwivedi, Yogatantra Granthamala, Kasi, 1972.
14. Malinivijayavarttika, Abhinavagupta, KSTS, 1921.
15. Mishra, Kamalakar, The Significance of Tantric Tradition, Ardhanariswar Publication, Varanasi, 1981.
16. Netra Tantra, ed. Vrajavallabha Diwedi, Parimal Publications, 1985.
17. Netra Tantra, Uddyota, Ksemaraja, KSTS.
18. Pandey, K.C., Abhinavagupta, An Historical & Philosophical Study, Chaukhamba Amarbharati Prakasana, Varanasi, 2006.
19. Pandit, B.N. Specific Principles of Kashmir Saivism Munsirama Manoher Lal Pub. (MRML), New Delhi.,1997.
20. Pandit, B.N., Essence of the Exact Reality or Paramarthasara of Abhinavagupta(MRML), 1997.
21. Pandit, B.N., The Mirror of Self-Supremacy or Svatantrya Darpana., MRML, 1997.
22. Rastogi, Navjivan, Introduction to Tantraloka; A Study in structure, MLBD, 1986.
23. Sarvadarsansamgraha, Umashankara Rishi(Hindi Trnas.), Chaukhamba Vidyabhavana, 1964.
24. Sivasutravimarsini, Ksemaraja, KSTS.
25. Sridaksinamurtistotram, Sankaracharya, Pracyavidyasamsodhanalaya Granthamala, 1972.
26. Spanda Karika Vivrti, Ksemaraja, KSTS, 1925.
27. Sivaraman, K., Saivism in Philosophical Perspective MLBD, 1993.
28. Sensharma, D.B., Philosophy of Sadhana, Karnal, 1983.
29. Sensharma, D.B., Studies in Tantra Yoga, Karnal, 1985.

30. Sanderson, Alexis, "Purity and Power among the Brahmanas of Kashmir", in the Category of Person; Anthropology, Philosophy, History ed. Michael Carrithers et al; Cambridge, 1985.
31. Tantraloka, Abhinavagupta, ed. R.C. Dwivedi and Navjivan Rastogi, Motilal Banarasi Dass Publishers, New Delhi (8 vol.) 1987.
32. Tantrasara, Abhinavagupta, KSTS, 1918.
33. Woods, J.H., The Yoga System of Pantanjali, MLBD.

सन्दर्भ ग्रन्थ
(देवनागरी वर्णमाला के अनुसार)

1 श्रीवास्तव, सुरेशचन्द्र, पातञ्जल योगदर्शन, योगसिद्धिभाष्य, चौखम्बा सुरभारती प्रकाशन, 2006
2 तीर्थ, स्वामी ओमानन्द, पातञ्जलयोगप्रदीप, गीताप्रेस गोरखपुर
3 कर्णाटक, डॉ0 विमला, पातञ्जल योगदर्शनम्, काशी हिन्दूविश्वविद्यालय प्रकाशन, 4 1991
4 आरण्य (क), हरिहरानन्द, पातञ्जल योगदर्शन, मोतीलाल बनारसीदास 2006
5 कविराज, गोपीनाथ, सम्पा0, योगिनीहृदय, अमृतानन्दकृत दीपिका तथा भास्कररायकृत सेतुबन्ध टीकाओं के साथ, वाराणसी, 1963
6 –भारतीय संस्कृति और साधना, दो खण्ड, बिहार राष्ट्रभाषा परिषद्, पटना, 1963,1964
7 –सम्पा0, त्रिपुरारहस्य (ज्ञानखण्ड), श्रीनिवासकृत तात्पर्यदीपिका सहित, वाराणसी, 1965
8 –तांत्रिक साधना और सिद्धान्त, बिहार राष्ट्रभाषा परिषद्, पटना,
9 –भारतीय साधना की धारा बिहार राष्ट्रभाषा परिषद्, पटना,
10 द्विवेदी, व्रजबल्लभ, सम्पा0, नित्याषोडशिकार्णव तंत्र, शिवानन्दकृत ऋजुविमर्शिनी एवं विद्यानन्दकृत अर्थरत्नावली टीकाओं के साथ, वाराणसी, 1968
11 रस्तोगी, नवजीवन, काश्मीर शिवाद्वयवाद की मूल अवधारणाएँ, मुंशीराम मनोहरलाल पब्लिशर्स, 2002

कोश

1 Abhyankar, K.V., *A Dictionary of Sanskrit Grammer*, Gaekwad Oiental Series, 134, Baroda, 1961.
2 Apte, V.S., *Sanskrit-English Dictionary*, Delhi, 1975.
3 झलकीकर, भीमाचार्य, सम्पा0, अमरकोश, दिल्ली, 1928
4 तर्कवाचस्पति, तारानाथ, वाचस्पत्यम्, 6 भाग, चौखम्बा संस्कृत ग्रन्थावलि, सं0 94, वाराणसी, 1962